E. Evans Wohlforth, Jr. Sabrina M. Galli

## **ROBINSON & COLE LLP**

666 Third Avenue, 20th Floor New York, New York 10017 Telephone: (212) 451-2900 Facsimile: (212) 451-2999

ewohlforth@rc.com sgalli@rc.com

Philippe Z. Selendy (admitted *pro hac vice*) Andrew R. Dunlap (admitted pro hac vice) Meredith Nelson (admitted pro hac vice) Elizabeth H. Snow (admitted pro hac vice)

**SELENDY GAY PLLC** 

1290 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10104

Tel: 212-390-9000

pselendy@selendygay.com

adunlap@selendygay.com

mnelson@selendygay.com

esnow@selendygay.com

Attorneys for Defendant Save On SP, LLC

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

JOHNSON & JOHNSON HEALTH CARE SYSTEMS INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

SAVE ON SP, LLC,

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 22-2632 (ES)(CLW)

Document Electronically Filed

**DECLARATION OF** E. EVANS WOHLFORTH, JR., ESQ., IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO SEAL

I, E. Evans Wohlforth, Jr., submit this Declaration in support of Defendant Save On SP, LLC's ("SaveOnSP") Motion to Permanently Seal portions of Johnson and Johnson Health Care Systems, Inc.'s ("JJHCS") June 20, 2024 Motion for In Camera Review and Exhibits 1-15, 1719 [ECF No. 322], SaveOnSP's Opposition and Exhibits 2-3 [ECF No. 325], and JJHCS's Reply [ECF No. 333].

- 1. I am an attorney duly authorized to practice law in the State of New Jersey and a member in good standing of the bar of this Court. I am a member of the law firm of Robinson & Cole, LLP, co-counsel for SaveOnSP.
- 2. I submit this Certification in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5.3 based upon my personal knowledge in support of the Motion to Seal. The information that SaveOnSP seeks to seal consists of SaveOnSP's confidential, internal information and communications about its marketing strategy and business plan, as well as proprietary business model, which SaveOnSP asserts is proprietary business information.
- 3. In accordance with Local Civ. R. 5.3(c)(3), attached hereto as Appendix A is the table documenting all materials to be sealed, the nature of the materials to be sealed, the legitimate private or public interest which warrants the relief sought, the clearly defined and serious injury that would result if the relief sought is not granted; and why a less restrictive alternative to the relief sought is not available. In summary, the information that SaveOnSP seeks to protect from public disclosure is SaveOnSP's confidential health and proprietary business information.
- 4. In accordance with Local Rule 5.3(c)(3)(f), this office contacted Plaintiff's counsel via e-mail to inquire as to Plaintiff's position on whether the materials that are the subject of this Motion should remain sealed. Plaintiff does not object to the proposed redactions.
- 5. Redacted versions of the documents containing SaveOnSP's confidential information are being filed with this Motion pursuant to Local Rule 5.3(c)(4), to ensure that the sealing is by the least restrictive means possible.

- 6. SaveOnSP asserts that it has a legitimate interest in maintaining the confidentiality of the redacted and sealed information contained in these filings and in avoiding the public disclosure of this information because it includes SaveOnSP's proprietary business information, the disclosure of which would grant SaveOnSP's business competitors an unfair competitive advantage. *See e.g.*, *Goldenberg v. Indel, Inc.*, 2012 WL 15909, at \*3 (D.N.J. Jan. 3, 2012) (granting motion to seal "commercially sensitive and proprietary non-public business information"); *Bracco Diagnostics, Inc. v. Amersham Health Inc.*, 2007 WL 2085350, at \*9-10 (D.N.J. July 18, 2007) (granting motion to seal where the public availability of documents containing confidential business information would have put a party at a competitive disadvantage).
- 7. SaveOnSP further asserts that it has a legitimate interest in maintaining the confidentiality of the redacted and sealed information contained in these filings and in avoiding the public disclosure of this information because it includes confidential patient health information, the disclosure of which would be harmful to patients. *See Rosario v. Doe*, No. CIV. 08-5185 RMB, 2013 WL 3283903, at \*2-3 (D.N.J. June 25, 2013) (Bumb, J.) (sealing records containing private medical information).
- 8. SaveOnSP has an interest in maintaining the confidentiality of the redacted information contained in JJHCS's June 20, 2024 Motion for In Camera Review, SaveOnSP's opposition, and JJHCS's Reply, as the documents and text message exhibits contain proprietary business information including but not limited to SaveOnSP's confidential marketing strategy and business plan, confidential litigation strategy, drug lists comprised of information about SaveOnSP's proprietary business model, and personal financial information belonging to

SaveOnSP's managers. SaveOnSP also has an interest in maintaining the confidentiality of the redacted information as the documents contain confidential patient health information.

- 9. Accordingly, SaveOnSP respectfully requests that the Court seal the unredacted versions of the Johnson and Johnson Health Care Systems, Inc.'s ("JJHCS") June 20, 2024 Motion for In Camera Review and Exhibits 1-15, 17-19 [ECF No. 322], SaveOnSP's Opposition and Exhibits 2-3 [ECF No. 325], and JJHCS's Reply [ECF No. 333].
  - 10. SaveOnSP submits that there is no less restrictive alternative available.
- SaveOnSP respectfully submits that it has satisfied the criteria for sealing a judicial 11. record set forth in Local Civil Rule 5.3. Accordingly, SaveOnSP requests that the Court grant its motion to seal materials.
- 12. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: July 22, 2024

By: s/ E. Evans Wohlforth, Jr.

E. Evans Wohlforth, Jr. Sabrina M. Galli

**ROBINSON & COLE LLP** 

666 Third Avenue, 20th Floor New York, NY 10017 Tel: (212) 451-2900 ewohlforth@rc.com sgalli@rc.com

and

Philippe Z. Selendy (admitted *pro hac vice*) Andrew R. Dunlap (admitted *pro hac vice*) Meredith Nelson (admitted pro hac vice) Elizabeth H. Snow (admitted pro hac vice)

SELENDY GAY PLLC 1290 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10104 Tel: 212-390-9000

pselendy@selendygay.com

adunlap@selendygay.com mnelson@selendygay.com esnow@selendygay.com

Attorneys for Defendant Save On SP, LLC